

From: Duane Thresher <dethresher@alaska.edu>
Subject: Plagiarism: Paul Bedell, Wireless Crash Course, Third Edition
Date: November 26, 2012 12:01:14 AM EST
To: legal@mcgraw-hill.com, customer.service@mcgraw-hill.com, info-en-c@wikimedia.org, jpadill@depaul.edu, LBryant2@depaul.edu, miller@cdm.depaul.edu, president@depaul.edu, le-inquiries@amazon.com, jeff@amazon.com

McGraw-Hill, Wikimedia, DePaul University and Amazon (see individual notes for each at bottom):

I have discovered clear and extensive plagiarism in Paul Bedell's book, Wireless Crash Course, Third Edition, published in September 2012 by McGraw-Hill. The plagiarism I found was mostly from Wikipedia. Bedell wrote this book while faculty at DePaul University, prominently mentions in several places his affiliation with DePaul, including his MS degree from there, and requires this text in a course he is teaching this term at DePaul, TDC 512 Cellular and Wireless Telecommunications. The book is sold on Amazon, along with three other Bedell books published by McGraw-Hill: "Wireless Crash Course, Second Edition (May 2005)", "Gigabit Ethernet for Metro Area Networks", and "Cellular/PCS Management".

All of the examples of plagiarism I found were in subjects not included in Bedell's 2005 Second Edition (nor does Wikipedia cite that) and were already in Wikipedia before Bedell's September 2012 Third Edition so they could NOT have been plagiarized by Wikipedia from Bedell. Further, Bedell admits in his email to me (attached EmailHistory.pdf) to having used Wikipedia for the 2012 Third Edition; yet there is no mention of Wikipedia in the book, neither as a citation in the examples where it should be nor even in the References at the end of the book. Finally, it's ridiculous to suggest he's all of the many anonymous Wikipedia authors involved and he'd still have to cite Wikipedia even if he was.

Attached is BedellPlagiarismEvidence.pdf and the PDF documentation mentioned within it. The list of examples is extensive but by no means exhaustive. Doing this careful detective work is tedious, time consuming and uncompensated and I should not have to provide more than this to prove clear and extensive plagiarism. There are almost certainly many more examples. A good place to start is by looking for bullet points in the book, looking up the subject of the bullet points in Wikipedia, and comparing to the bullet points found there (however, bullet points aren't the only passages Bedell plagiarized).

I shouldn't have to explain what constitutes plagiarism to anyone this is being emailed to so I won't. Bedell sometimes makes non-substantial changes (favorites: expanding or substituting acronyms, slightly changing numbers, swapping words for numbers and vice versa). This is either an attempt to

evade detection by search, indicating intent to deceive, or the ridiculous high-school notion that making a very minor change makes it no longer plagiarism, indicating an unbelievable ignorance of citation rules. Either makes him ineligible to be a published author and university lecturer.

How I discovered Bedell's plagiarism: I purchased Wireless Crash Course, Third Edition, soon after it came out in September 2012 and began to read it, a little every now and then. The writing got worse and worse and by Chapter 4 in mid-November I found myself Googling many of his subjects, invariably leading to Wikipedia (always the first Google entry) to find a source where I could check what he was writing. When I came to the section of the book of the first plagiarism example, the bullet list in the book was there in Wikipedia. This plagiarism example was particularly telling because Wikipedia has an error in it that would have been seen if the original sources had been looked at (see end of my first email to Bedell in EmailHistory.pdf). I emailed Bedell, he emailed back, and I responded; all in EmailHistory.pdf. Then, just out of curiosity since I'd already found enough proof, I went looking for other examples of plagiarism in the book. I immediately found them on the next pages in the next section about a different subject. Then I found even more by just opening to the middle of the book, finding some bullet points, and looking up their subject in Wikipedia. The same bullet points were often right there in Wikipedia.

No excuse of it being unintentional plagiarism is reasonably possible. It seems clear Bedell had intent to deceive. Further, in a way that indicated panic at being caught, Bedell has flatly denied the plagiarism altogether in his email, not apologetically said it was unintentional. Any honest reasonably-intelligent person can see Bedell's was intentional plagiarism.

McGraw-Hill: Paul Bedell's Wireless Crash Course, Third Edition, should be retracted and taken off the market; refunds should be given to those who have already purchased it with no time-consuming return of the book required. I seriously doubt whether anyone, including Bedell, could ever ferret out all the places he plagiarizes; probably many are not even from Wikipedia and that's the only place I checked. If you tried and then republished, someone would probably find more plagiarism and you'd have to repeat the cycle. Definitely a money and reputation losing proposition. Moreover, if Bedell plagiarized in one book so profusely he probably did it in his others so they should be retracted and taken off the market as well.

Amazon: You can see from the preceding paragraph that you should immediately stop selling these books. Issuing a lot of refunds is a money losing proposition, especially when you pay for the postage both ways for defective products.

DePaul: On the web page for TDC 512 your university academic integrity/plagiarism policy is stated and includes "If proven, a charge of plagiarism

could result in an automatic F in the course and possible expulsion. The strongest of sanctions will be imposed on anyone who submits as his/her own work any assignment which has been prepared by someone else." The policy for instructors, who should know better, should be even tougher. Students have been expelled for much less than what Bedell has done. I don't see how you could ever again seriously enforce your academic integrity/plagiarism policy with Paul Bedell as a lecturer there. No big deal, "lesson learned" (see his email) is not an answer for plagiarism that would be accepted by any instructor nor should it be accepted FROM an instructor. You should also check Bedell's MS thesis work for plagiarism since again, if Bedell plagiarized in one book so profusely, he probably did it in his other less-public writing. Finally, Bedell makes the students in TDC 512, which has the book as the required text, vulnerable to plagiarism accusations in citing from the book.

Let me know by when you will take action on this matter. If nothing happens by then or this date is unreasonably far in the future I will pursue the matter further elsewhere, much more publically. No more proof will be provided by me. If what I provided is not enough proof for you than this will indicate to me that no amount will be and that I should just take this matter further elsewhere. Any blaming of the messenger (e.g., attempts to silence me, retaliation, particularly lawsuits), including by Bedell, will again immediately result in me pursuing the matter further elsewhere, much more publically.

Duane Thresher
PhD, Columbia University, Earth & Environmental Sciences
BS, Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), Electrical Engineering & Computer Science